

AYLESBEARE
(Ottery St Mary Rural)

07/1787/FUL

Target Date: 20.08.2007

Applicant: Mr A Todd

Location: Tatry, West Hill

Proposal: Erection of detached replacement dwelling

CONSULTATIONS

County Highway Authority

No objection

Natural England

No comments received

TOWN COUNCIL

Approved

WARD MEMBER(S)

No comments received.

REPRESENTATIONS

No letters of representation have been received.

PLANNING POLICIES

Government Guidance

PPS 1 - Planning Policy Statement 1: Delivering Sustainable Development
PPS 7 – Planning Policy Statement 7: Sustainable Development in Rural Areas
PPS 3 – Housing

Devon County Structure Plan (2001-2016)

Policy CO6 – Quality of New Development
Policy TR10 – Strategic Road Network

East Devon Local Plan (1995-2011)

Policy D1 – Design and Local Distinctiveness
Policy H11 – Replacement of Existing Dwellings in the Countryside
Policy S5 – Countryside Protection
Policy TA7 – Adequacy of Road Network and Site Access

SITE LOCATION AND DESCRIPTION

The application site relates to 'Tatry' an existing chalet style bungalow located on the west side of West Hill Road, and outside of the built-up area boundary of the village in a line of ribbon development on this side of West Hill Road; properties on this side of the road are of a variety of designs and form and are set back from the road frontage and relatively well screened by trees/hedgerow planting.

The existing property is accessed off West Hill Road and served by a driveway in the south east corner of the site with the existing dwelling located toward the northern boundary and in the eastern most half of the plot. The main dwelling is finished in render with a tiled roof and has a large detached triple garage to its north side. There is a further large extension to the northwest of the main house and to the rear of the garage. The land on the site slopes away to the rear (west) and is largely laid to lawn. The southern boundary is formed by a line of mature evergreen trees and there is further tree planting and a hedgerow to the rear, front and north boundaries. The front boundary is set back behind a wide grass verge and is formed by a hedgebank with a group of mature trees at the southern end.

PROPOSED DEVELOPMENT

The application seeks planning permission for the erection of a replacement two storey dwelling on the site.

CONSIDERATIONS AND ASSESSMENT

It is considered that the main issues in the determination of the application relate to the design of the replacement dwelling (including its increased height and mass), the potential impact on neighbouring amenity, the affect on the character and appearance of the surrounding area and on trees of amenity importance. The proposal would utilise the existing access and is for a replacement as opposed to an additional dwelling it is not therefore considered that there would be any highway safety issues resulting from the proposal.

Design

In terms of design, the proposal is of a simple rectangular form with a small gable projection and chicket gables to the windows on the front elevation and a lean-to canopy at ground floor level. The attached garage is set at right angles forward of the dwelling. On the rear elevation, there is a large central gable projection with first floor balconies to either side. The materials proposed are brick with contrasting brick detail, hardwood fenestration and concrete tiles to the roof. The surrounding area displays a variety of materials, design and form of dwellings such that there is no overall pattern to conform to.

Policy H11 of the Local Plan relates to the replacement of dwellings in the countryside. The policy sets out the criteria against which such applications should be assessed. Firstly, there must be an existing habitable dwelling on the site which is not the subject of a restrictive occupancy condition. The existing dwelling complies with this criterion. Secondly the replacement dwelling is located on, or adjacent to the footprint of the existing dwelling, which the proposal is. Thirdly, the proposed replacement dwelling is of a similar size, scale, height and mass to the existing dwelling. In this last regard the proposed dwelling is considerably higher than the existing dwelling and its massing greater.

The existing property is fairly low lying and although it has benefited from a large linked extension to the rear it is relatively well screened within the wider landscape and in particular from West Hill Road where only glimpsed views of the front roof slope are possible.

The proposal represents a substantial increase in the floor area of the property from 216 m² to 338 m² the majority of the additional floor area would result from the increased height to a full 2 storey house. The footprint of the building (set slightly further back in the plot) would only increase by 21 m² but its height would increase by 3.4 metres. This increase in size and scale would make it considerably more visible and apparent from the main road.

By consolidating the existing mass of the dwelling and extensions/outbuildings within a single form also accentuates the apparent increase in mass of the building. It is considered that in this regard the proposal would be clearly contrary to policy.

The purpose of the policy is two fold. Firstly, there is a need to ensure that the landscape and visual impact of dwellings is not significantly greater than the existing property and secondly, it seeks to retain housing stock at the smaller end of the scale which is relatively more affordable. Although the proposed dwelling would be set back well within the plot and there is some screening of this from the road it would certainly be more visible than the existing bungalow which is barely noticeable with only the upper part of its roof slope visible. As such the proposal would draw attention to the property and its presence outside of a built-up area boundary which due to its scale and design appears more urban and would therefore start to erode the rural character of the area. In the second regard, the proposal would result in an existing two bedroom property being replaced with a considerably larger 4/5 bedroom property and as such would result in the property being considerably more expensive and attainable by fewer local potential occupiers.

Impact on neighbouring residential amenity

The proposal is set toward the northern boundary and there are no immediate neighbours to this side. To the south the neighbouring property boundary is over 20 metres from the proposed south elevation and high level screening is provided by a line of evergreen trees. It is not considered the proposal would have any adverse impact on neighbouring privacy or amenity.

Impact on trees of amenity importance

The proposed siting is further away from the front boundary and the north boundary where there are some existing mature/semi mature trees which are already coming into conflict with the existing garage. Moving development further from these is likely to be of benefit and in the absence of any comments from the Council's arboricultural officers there are no objections in this regard.

CONCLUSIONS

The application proposes to replace the existing modest chalet bungalow with a considerably larger and more substantial two storey property. The replacement dwelling would be considerably higher and its massing greater than the existing property and as such would be contrary to policy on replacement dwellings in the countryside and be more visible from the public highway and detract from the semi-rural character of the surrounding area. The application is therefore recommended for refusal for the following reason.

RECOMMENDATIONS

REFUSE for the following reasons:

1. The proposal by reason of its design and in particular its increased size, height, scale and massing would result in a considerably larger replacement dwelling which would be visually more prominent and out of character with the semi-rural nature of its surroundings and which would lead to the loss of a smaller and relatively more affordable property in a countryside location, as such the proposal would be contrary to policy H11 (Replacement of Existing Dwellings in the Countryside) of the Adopted East Devon Local – 2006.

Note to applicant

CN05 – 06203/L, 06203/01 to 06203/05 inc.